

# INTERNATIONAL JOURNAL OF MULTIDISCIPLINARY: APPLIED BUSINESS AND EDUCATION RESEARCH

2024, Vol. 5, No. 1, 150 – 160

<http://dx.doi.org/10.11594/ijmaber.05.01.15>

---

## Research Article

### Factors Contributing to Business Failure and Eventual Exit among Selected Tutorial Service Centers

Ma. Louise Gena D. Crisologo\*, Emilina R. Sarreal, Manuel R. Tanpoco

Department of Decision Sciences and Innovation, De La Salle University, City of Manila, 0922 Philippines

---

#### Article history:

Submission January 2024

Revised January 2024

Accepted January 2024

#### \*Corresponding author:

E-mail:

[ma.louise.crisologo@dlsu.edu.ph](mailto:ma.louise.crisologo@dlsu.edu.ph)

#### ABSTRACT

Business failure and exit are concomitants of business discontinuance which must be extensively studied as businesses such as tutorial centers can experience unfavorable events. This paper investigated the internal (i.e., owner/founder orientations) and external (i.e., compliance with government policies) antecedents leading to business failure and the eventual exit in the shadow education industry in 2013, particularly of Philippine privately owned tutorial centers which are divided into non-registered and registered services. Using the multiple case study approach, empirical findings showed that business failure is primarily caused by internal factors specifically the owner/founder orientations, while non-compliance with government regulations is secondary. The owner/founder orientations were comprised of motivation, characteristics/behavior, skill managerial deficiencies, capabilities, and financial knowledge shortcomings. Non-registered tutorial centers asserted that only skill/managerial deficiencies and capabilities lead to failure while registered tutorial services perceived all as reasons for business failure. Not complying with government policies can affect more the registered tutorial services than the non-registered centers. Business exit was chosen by all the owners of tutorial centers as a viable option in case of business failure. Future studies can consider obtaining more participants and comprehensively investigating tutorial centers from different countries to enrich cross-country research in shadow education.

**Keywords:** *Business exit, Business failure, Tutorial service*

---

#### How to cite:

Crisologo, M. L. G. D., Sarreal, E. R., & Tanpoco, M. R. (2024). Factors Contributing to Business Failure and Eventual Exit among Selected Tutorial Service Centers. *International Journal of Multidisciplinary: Applied Business and Education Research*. 5(1), 150 – 160. doi: 10.11594/ijmaber.05.01.15

## **Introduction**

Business discontinuance is closely linked with business exit and business failure. To understand business discontinuance, one must fully comprehend what business exit and business failure are (Klimas et al., 2021; Amankwah-Amoah et al., 2018). Most of the journals identified the difference between business exit and business failure and determined the factors and considerations of both that lead to such occurrences. Many factors and considerations are needed to know why a business either fails or just decides to exit (Bushe, 2019). Business failure can be attributed to internal and external aspects, while business exits can be voluntarily or involuntarily. Based on the related literature, business discontinuance is the endpoint of business failure, while it is also one of the choices of business exit.

The proponent's personal experience, enthusiasm, and inclination to determine factors that lead to business discontinuation initiated the conduct of this study. The study was conducted in 2013 when face-to-face tutorials were more prevalent than online sessions. Based on the latest data on scholarly discourses about shadow education (SE) in the Philippines or the activities done (either academic or non-academic) that simulate the system of instructions of educational institutions, de Castro and de Guzman in 2014 are the last ones to study comprehensively the private tutorial services in the country (Hajar & Karakus, 2022). This paper can provide additional and significant contributions to the study of local businesses in the SE industry since personal tutorial services in Asia including the Philippines are still relevant (Bray, 2022).

This paper used the case study approach to explore factors that lead to business discontinuation and eventually exit. With most of the studies done outside the Philippine setting, this study aimed to research business discontinuation specifically for the educational services sector. The study gathered information from businesses that have already ceased and ongoing operations as respondents to find various reasons for their business' failure and exit. With the proponent's personal experience and the rising occurrence of tutorial services' closure, this research is worth pursuing.

Concordant with the proponents' intention to determine factors that will lead to business discontinuation, the following research problems were investigated:

1. Why do tutorial services exit and eventually discontinue their business?
2. How do external and internal factors contribute to business failure and exit of tutorial service centers?
3. What is the relevance of compliance with government policies to business failure and eventual exit of tutorial service centers?

## **Literature Review**

### ***Business Failure and Decline***

Business failure is one of the top areas of interest in present business research primarily focused on two domains which are the causes and the implications of failure (Klimas et al., 2021). It has multifarious definitions that generally incorporate terms such as insolvency, bankruptcy, the 'end state', and performance decline (Bushe, 2019; Zambrano Farias et al., 2021). Meanwhile, Amankwah-Amoah & Wang (2019) mentioned that business failure is the outcome of 'distressed businesses' that failed to quickly adapt to industry changes. Other scholars associated the failure to the need or want to sell or liquidate to avoid losses or to pay off creditors or the general inability to make a profitable go of the business (Chirico et al., 2020). Lattacher & Wdowiak (2020) posit that failure can be interpreted through three lenses which are market vanishment, organizational failure, and the personal decision of the owner. The study provided a substantial review of articles in which business failure is linked to business discontinuance due to the lack of adequate financial resources, termination of business operations, and exit intention.

Furthermore, several articles on business failure theorized ventures are in a 'decline' state when their performance worsens (decreasing resource slack) over consecutive periods, and it experiences distress in continuing operations (Bushe, 2019; Amankwah-Amoah & Wang, 2019). The decline is a natural antecedent to business failure. This gives rise to the company's perturbation to correct and improve as swiftly as possible the inefficiencies in their business operations. Multifarious

terminologies were linked to decline such as underperforming businesses, “living dead” businesses, and “persistent technical insolvent” businesses. Additionally, the decline of a company can be described depending on the seriousness of the challenges being experienced either internally or externally (Safari and Das, 2023).

#### *Internal factors*

There are several internal factors to consider leading to business failure. Extant literature attributed these to human capital and knowledge or the owner/founder orientations which encompass motivations, skills or management deficiencies, capabilities, characteristics/behavior, and financial knowledge shortcomings (Bushe, 2019; Martinez et al., 2019; Bunyaminu et al. 2019). The competency and the leadership style of the management are significant factors for organizational performance (Davies, C., & van Vuuren, 2021). Lack of entrepreneurial skills as a difficulty in starting and managing their firms during their early stages is a major cause of business failure for small businesses (Bushe, 2019). There appears to be a trend that years of schooling and higher education level are positively associated with a firm’s performance (Bonaccorsi et al., 2023), stressing that successful exit is more likely to take place among highly educated owners running firms in skilled-service fields, such as professional services; individuals with prior experience in the field where they set up their small business; the existence of strong owner human-capital traits, namely, college graduates with relevant prior work experience. Additionally, Ahmad & Ahmad (2018) asserted that multiple skills of management are pivotal for the business to flourish.

#### *External factors*

While other businesses have excellent management systems, there are external forces that are beyond control. The onslaught of the COVID-19 pandemic, for instance, has produced significant damage socioeconomically which led to business failures (Amankwah-Amoah et al., 2021). More specifically, the external factors comprise government and insufficient government-related policies, lack of

support from banks and financial institutions, inadequate economic sphere, international developments, environmental protection, and other regulatory requirements, the bankruptcy of main customers and suppliers, technological changes, and catastrophic unpredictable events/disaster (Bushe, 2019; Bunyaminu et al., 2019; Amankwah-Amoah et al., 2021). Additionally, Hashmi et al. (2018) asserted that the trend in researching business process compliance (BPC) in terms of government policies plummeted over the past years. Hence, there is a need to critically analyze this as an essential external factor since non-compliance with government policies can damage the financial condition and reputation of a business (Sheikh et al., 2023), eventually leading to business failure.

#### ***Business Exit***

There are extensive scholarly discourses on business exit particularly in times of economic regression such as the experience during the pandemic. As Cefis et al. (2022) stated, business exits can either influence or be influenced by macroeconomic changes. Business exit fundamentally refers to the decision of the business to shut down or leave the industry because of the lost capability and identity to operate (Amankwah-Amoah et al., 2018). Moreover, numerous factors can predict exit such as the internal and external environment, various kinds of uncertainties, productivity levels, and the capacity to innovate (Cefis et al., 2022). Meanwhile, Hohen & Schweizer (2021) argued that exit is not only due to poor performance but can also be attributed to personal pursuits. There are three options for the owner which are: (1) A financial harvest strategy such as acquisition by other firms for higher returns; (2) a stewardship exit strategy exemplified by management buyout and family succession; and (3) voluntary cessation strategy which is an indication that the business has already accomplished its purpose.

#### ***Business Discontinuation and Closure***

Business discontinuation refers to the termination of operations and eventual closure (Davies & van Vuuren, 2021). Existing research frames entrepreneurial exit mostly as business

exit, i.e. the discontinuation of the business implying business failure (Klimas et al., 2021). Business discontinuation is usually viewed as a business failure at the same time one of the modes of business exit. Based on the Global Entrepreneurship Monitor (GEM), the term refers to business owners who shut down their firms over the last 12 months. Meanwhile, the GEM methodology defined an “established business” as a firm that successfully survived the 42-month stage (Bosma & Kelley, 2019, as cited in Davies, C., & van Vuuren, 2021). Business discontinuation is an important feature of dynamic economies, and entries and exits of businesses are closely linked (Cefis et al., 2022). In addition, discontinuing the business provides options for the owner to either merge, sell, or liquidate the properties (Chirico et al., 2020).

### **Framework and Propositions**

Extant literature showed several internal and external factors that result in a business discontinuation. The external causes are deemed to be less foreseeable compared to internal factors. Many studies pointed to internal factors as the main reason why business failure occurs. Most emphasized human capital and knowledge, structural, financial, and others. Human capital and knowledge consist mainly of the owner/founder’s motivations (disappointment in the business), skills/managerial deficiencies (dearth of management skills and management style development training), capabilities (insufficient education, knowledge, and experience), characteristics/behavior (nepotism, family problems and overconfidence on others) and financial knowledge shortcomings (no accounting background, cash flow analysis). Structural is about the firm itself i.e. departure of competent staff, growth strategies, entry mode, increased centralization, and decline of sales or orders. Financial resources pertain to the obtainment of monetary funds for the business through one’s personal finances, colleagues, and relatives. The two main reasons behind failure lie in having inadequate financial resources but more importantly in lack of adequate managerial competence (Bushe, 2019; Martinez et al., 2019; Bunyaminu et al. 2019; Davies, C., & van

Vuuren, 2021). On the other hand, the external factors mainly include government and insufficient government-related policies, complex regulatory requirements and processes, and unexpected environmental events disrupting the business operations (Bushe, 2019; Bunyaminu et al., 2019; Amankwah-Amoah et al., 2021).

In the Philippine setting, considering the culture and pride of the citizens, many businesses are not fond of broadcasting or saying the reasons why they discontinued their businesses. Since this research on business discontinuation is not locally recognized, the researcher, given the limited time, would like to take advantage of discovering the reasons why businesses discontinue. Is it because of the owner himself and how she/he managed the business or the external factors such as the government and its policies? The study will focus on educational services since the researcher will be applying her own experience to the study.

Considering all the internal and external factors leading to business discontinuation factors were narrowed down to the owner/manager/founder’s motivations, skill/managerial deficiencies, capabilities, and characteristics/behavior for internal, while government and insufficient government-related policies for external. The propositions for this research were formulated:

**Proposition 1:** Owner/Founder’s motivations play a major role in business failure and eventual exit.

**Proposition 2:** Owner/Founder’s motivations do not play a major role in business failure and eventual exit.

**Proposition 3:** Owner/Founder’s skill/managerial deficiencies play a major role in business failure and eventual exit.

**Proposition 4:** Owner/Founder’s skill/managerial deficiencies do not play a major role in business failure and eventual exit.

**Proposition 5:** Owner/Founder’s capabilities play a major role in business failure and eventual exit.

**Proposition 6:** Owner/Founder’s capabilities do not play a major role in business failure and eventual exit.

**Proposition 7:** Owner/Founder's characteristics/behavior play a major role in business failure and eventual exit.

**Proposition 8:** Owner/Founder's characteristics/behavior do not play a major role in business failure and eventual exit.

**Proposition 9:** Owner/Founder's financial knowledge shortcomings play a major role in business failure and eventual exit.

**Proposition 10:** Owner/Founder's financial knowledge shortcomings do not play a major role in business failure and eventual exit.

**Proposition 11:** Non-compliance with government policies and regulations is more likely to result in business failure of registered tutorial service centers compared to non-registered centers.

**Proposition 12:** Non-compliance with government policies and regulations is more likely to result in business failure of non-registered tutorial service centers compared to registered tutorial centers.

## Methods

The research was an exploratory-descriptive study that mainly utilized the case study research method. It investigated the internal (i.e., owner/founder orientations) and external (non-compliance with government policies) antecedents of business failure and business exit of tutorial services. The study utilized the multiple case study method, with a holistic design, as this research was focused on 4 tutorial services businesses, wherein two are discontinued and nonregistered government and another two are ongoing and registered tutorial services, comprising of 4 cases. "The evidence from multiple cases is often considered more compelling, and the overall study is therefore regarded as being more robust" (Herriott & Firestone, as cited in Yin, 2009). To achieve the aims of the study, the proponent utilized strategies in the study not just for data gathering but also to comprehensively identify the validity and reliability of the data gathered and come up with sound interpretations. The study made use of questionnaires, interviews, documents, and archives to gather data on the firm's managerial knowledge/human capital orientation and compliance with government registration policies, the respondents' degree of awareness

regarding business failure, and exit. Pattern matching and cross-case synthesis were used in the analysis of data.

There are three components in this case study, namely the context, units of analysis, and the cases. The context is the Philippine tutorial services industry, while the owners of the privately owned tutorial centers serve as the study's units of analysis. Lastly, each of the selected tutorial services (non-government and government registered) serve as the cases of this study.

## Sample

Four samples were chosen as subjects for further investigation. The subjects or samples selected for this study are four privately owned tutorial centers in the Philippines. Two of the tutorial centers have been discontinued and are non-government registered, while the other two still exist and are government registered.

From each tutorial center, an owner-manager is responsible for educating, organizing, supervising, developing, and initiating services and products of and for the tutorial center as the respondent. The owners of tutorial centers mainly consisted of educators, particularly teachers. Based on the experience of the researcher, her mother is a retired teacher, her expertise, skills, and capabilities as a teacher will help in managing the tutorial center since it promotes learning and acts as an extension of educating children outside their schools. It also must be taken note that the mother, together with her colleagues, used to have a tutorial center in her previous school. Tutorial centers require teachers or educators to operate, for they have sufficient knowledge of educating people through their experience and expertise. The respondents of this study will include TSC1 (owned by the researcher), the tutorial center owned by the mother of the researcher and her colleagues, TSC4 (owned by the friend of the mother), and TSC3 (owned by the researcher's neighbor).

## Data Collection and Analysis

This study utilized two major techniques and sources of evidence for the collection of data: First are interviews and email

correspondence and second are the tutorial center documents. Interviews were done by establishing first the focused topics followed by the responses of the participants. Guide questions were provided to make sure that the data gathered were parallel to the aims of this study. The data were collected in 2013 when face-to-face tutorial services were more prevalent than online tutorials.

To explore and understand the dynamic context of business failure and eventual business exit, it is important that the respondents can freely explain and talk about the experience of the tutorial centers that have already ceased. For the tutorial centers that have not experienced business discontinuation, business failure was still discussed since the case study needed to know the potential causes of business failure and how they can prevent it or business turnaround.

Two questionnaires were deployed to the respondents. The first questionnaire was used during the interview and focused on the internal and external aspects leading to business failure and eventual exit. The second questionnaire was an extension of the first questionnaire and was sent through email. These questionnaires were customized to fit the study for the selected discontinued and existing tutorial

services businesses. To critically analyze the business failure process and understand the reasons behind the venture’s failure and exit, the questions were constructed with consideration of the different internal and external causes of the firm failure. The questionnaires focused on the knowledge of tutorial services in sustaining business knowledge and coping with business failure.

Pattern matching, a method of analysis that compares an empirically based pattern with a predicted one (Trochim, as cited in Yin, 2009) was also employed in the process of validating the propositions formulated.

With the research design being a multiple case study, a cross-case synthesis was utilized in the analysis of research data. This technique was used in examining and comparing the similarities and differences of internal and external causes of business failure and eventually business exit between the two discontinued and non-government registered tutorial centers and 2 ongoing and government registered tutorial centers.

**Results**

The study conducted validation of the propositions, which were matched on the cases that were used in the pattern matching done.

*Table 1. Pattern Matching Results*

Propositions	Unregistered		Registered	
	TSC1	TSC2	TSC3	TSC4
[ 1 ] Owner/Founder’s Motivation plays a major role in business failure and eventual exit	Not Validated	Not Validated	Validated	Validated
[ 2 ] Owner/Founder’s Motivation does not play a major role in business failure and eventual exit	Validated	Validated	Not Validated	Not Validated
[ 3 ] Owner/Founder’s Skill/Managerial Deficiencies play a major role in business failure and eventual exit	Validated	Not Validated	Validated	Not Validated
[ 4 ] Owner/Founder’s Skill/Managerial Deficiencies do not play a major role in business failure and eventual exit	Not Validated	Validated	Not Validated	Validated
[ 5 ] Owner/Founder’s Capabilities play a major role in business failure and eventual exit	Not Validated	Validated	Validated	Not Validated

Propositions	Unregistered		Registered	
	TSC1	TSC2	TSC3	TSC4
[ 6 ] Owner/Founder’s Capabilities do not play a major role in business failure and eventual exit	Validated	Not Validated	Not Validated	Validated
[ 7 ] Owner/Founder’s Characteristics/behavior play a major role in business failure and eventual exit	Not Validated	Not Validated	Validated	Not Validated
[ 8 ] Owner/Founder’s Characteristics/behavior do not play a major role in business failure and eventual exit	Validated	Validated	Not Validated	Validated
[ 9 ] Owner/Founder’s Financial knowledge shortcomings play a major role in business failure and eventual exit	Not Validated	Not Validated	Validated	Not Validated
[ 10 ] Owner/Founder’s Financial knowledge shortcomings do not play a major role in business failure and eventual exit	Validated	Validated	Not Validated	Validated
[ 11 ] Non-compliance with government policies and regulations is more likely to result in business failure for registered tutorial service centers compared to non-registered tutorial centers.	Not Validated	Not Validated	Validated	Validated
[ 12 ] Non-compliance with government policies and regulations is more likely to result in business failure for non-registered tutorial service centers compared to registered tutorial centers.	Validated	Validated	Not Validated	Not Validated

**Propositions 1 and 2:**

Motivation played a major role in business failure and the eventual exit, for registered tutorial centers. Unregistered businesses such as TSC1 and TSC2 chose skill/managerial deficiencies and capabilities as important factors for failure and exit, respectively. Thus proposition 2 is deemed not validated for registered businesses since they claimed motivation as crucial for business failure and exit.

**Propositions 3 and 4:**

Skill/managerial deficiencies played a major role in business failure and eventual exit for TSC3 and TSC1. On the other hand, motivation and capabilities were seen as important factors for business failure by TSC4 and TSC2, respectively. Thus, proposition 4 is not validated for TSC3 and TSC1 since they considered Skill/managerial deficiencies as relevant to business failure and exit. Therefore, whether the business is registered or not, lack of skills

and managerial deficiencies are considered vital for business failure.

**Propositions 5 and 6:**

Capabilities played a major role in business failure and eventual exit for TSC3 and TSC2. On the other hand, motivation and skill/managerial deficiencies were seen as important factors for business failure by TSC4 and TSC1, respectively. Thus, proposition 6 is not validated for TSC3 and TSC2 since they considered capabilities as relevant to business failure and exit. Therefore, whether the business is registered or not, a lack of capabilities was considered vital for business failure.

**Propositions 7 and 8:**

Characteristics/behavior played a major role in business failure and eventual exit for TSC3. On the other hand, motivation, capabilities, and skill/managerial deficiencies were seen as important factors for business failure

by TSC4, TSC2 and TSC1, respectively. Unregistered tutorial centers do not see characteristics as a factor for business failure.

**Propositions 9 and 10:**

Financial knowledge shortcomings played a major role in business failure and eventual exit for TSC3 and TSC2. On the other hand, motivation, capabilities, and skill/managerial deficiencies were seen as important factors for business failure by TSC4, TSC2, and TSC1, respectively. Unregistered businesses do not see financial knowledge shortcomings as vital factors for business failure.

**Propositions 11 and 12:**

Registered tutorial centers find non-compliance with government policies and regulations significant and more likely to result in business failure and eventual exit. On the other hand, unregistered tutorial centers deemed non-compliance with government policies and regulations not relevant and important.

**Discussion and Conclusion**

After careful analysis of the results, the researcher was able to discover the actual and potential factors, contributions of internal and external factors that lead to business failure and eventual exit, reasons why tutorial centers exit and eventually discontinue, and the relevance of business compliance with government rules in business failure and eventual exit among selected tutorial centers.

Concordant with the literature, as opposed to the notion that businesses will ascribe their failure to external antecedents, empirical findings showed that management deficiency is the primary reason for business failure. It is more of the internal factors why businesses exit and discontinue parallel to the studies reviewed (Bushe, 2019; Martinez et al., 2019; Bunyaminu et al. 2019; Davies, C., & van Vuuren, 2021). Moreover, all the respondents believed that owner/founder orientation, structural or firm issues, and financial conditions are the internal factors that lead to business failure and exit. On the other hand, external factors are deemed important but are secondary to internal factors. The majority of the respondents chose bankruptcy of main customers and suppliers as the

external factors that lead to business failure and eventual exit. Non-compliance with government policies and regulations and the absence of financial support from banks and suppliers were other external factors chosen by the registered tutorial centers. The non-registered tutorial centers chose technological changes and disasters/catastrophic events as their other external factors disaster. These findings are in line with recent literature that probed external factors as antecedents of business failures (Bushe, 2019; Bunyaminu et al., 2019; Amankwah-Amoah et al., 2021).

The empirical studies on business failure examined the role of various owners and firm characteristics and the numerous characteristics shared by failed firms are directly related to human capital and knowledge (Mayr et al., 2021). This study focused on owner/founder orientations among all the internal factors. The registered tutorial centers believed that motivation is crucial for business failure and exit (Proposition 1). They have been in the industry for more than ten years and are more knowledgeable of the business and motivation drives them to strive better. The non-registered tutorial centers believed skill/managerial deficiencies greatly affect business failure. Also, they only existed for less than ten years with a lack of managerial and marketing skills that led to their failure and exit. Non-registered tutorial centers do not see motivation, characteristics/behavior (Proposition 7), and financial knowledge shortcomings (Proposition 10) as vital factors for business failure. Whether the business is registered or not, lack of skills and managerial deficiencies (Proposition 3) and lack of capabilities (Proposition 5) were considered vital for business failure. For a business to succeed, the owner/founder must be motivated, which will be shown through his/her characteristics/behavior (Ephrem et al., 2021). Having enough knowledge of the financial aspect of the business is also important for the owner/founder to keep track of the growth of the business, while skill/managerial deficiencies and capabilities come in secondary.

Registered tutorial centers asserted that business failure is due to non-compliance of business policies and regulations, no financial support from banks and other financial

institutions, and bankruptcy of main customers and suppliers. While the non-registered tutorial centers believed that business failure is due to bankruptcy of main customers and suppliers, technological changes, and disasters/catastrophic events.

Compliance with government policies and regulations in the Philippines is highly required. Therefore, the relevance of business registration is very important and contributes to business failure. Government and government-related policies are also important factors affecting business failures. The registered tutorial centers believe that complying with business policies and regulations is a necessity. It is necessary and a responsibility that every entrepreneur must conform to. On the other hand, unregistered tutorial centers see compliance with government policies and regulations as an added expense and very costly. They believe that the government does not meet their needs (i.e. free training/seminars and quick one-stop shop assistance), even if they comply with the necessary policies and regulations.

Complying with government policies and regulations in return gives protection to businesses who comply with government policies and regulations (Hashmi et al., 2018). Completing the necessary government requirements gives the registered tutorial centers a sense of security from experiencing possible failure and knowing that they paid the right taxes and fees before starting the business and while the business is growing. Having complete government requirements, businesses can easily avail themselves of loans in financial institutions, wherein the loans can be used to expand the business. On the other hand, unregistered tutorial centers know that complying with government policies and regulations is required before starting a business. However, they see these government policies and regulations as an added expense because it is very costly, and the government does not meet their needs once they can comply with the government requirements. Non-compliance with the rules and regulations of the authorities can result in business failure. Registered tutorial centers find non-compliance with government policies and regulations relevant and more likely to lead to business failure and eventual exit (Proposition

11). The findings of the study imply that internal and external factors direct signs and pre-conditions that may lead to business decline. Before business failure, business decline must be first understood. Corporate decline generally does not stem from a single factor, it results from an accumulation of decisions, actions, and commitments to that become entangled in self-perpetuating workplace dynamics.

There are strategies suggested in this study to prevent business failure. The majority of the respondents chose to change their structural or firm issues for internal factors, while the external factors vary for both registered and non-registered tutorial centers. If these strategies fail to prevent business failure, majority of the respondents will increase production and supply and marketing and advertisement as their strategies to cope with business failure. However, if all efforts failed, all the respondents chose business exit so as not to affect the needs of the clients and the employees. Most of the respondents chose to pass on as their business exit mode. Passing on to family members since these members have the knowledge and capability to run the business. They also believe that the business is still feasible and that reestablishing the enterprise is still possible even if there is a decline in the business.

Since there is scarce research on tutorial centers in the Philippines, one area for future research is getting more samples to analyze their post-pandemic conditions. Second, a comparative study on factors of business failure in different industries would be interesting. Third, studies that examine the effect of motivations, capabilities, skill or managerial deficiencies, characteristics or behavior, and financial knowledge shortcomings with more participants and comparative studies for both unsuccessful and successful businesses in the shadow education industry would also be appealing. Future studies on private tutorial services in different countries can also be explored to enrich cross-country research on shadow education.

## References

Ahmad, I., & Ahmad, S. (2018). Multiple skills and medium enterprises' performance in Punjab Pakistan: A pilot study. *The Journal*

- of *Social Sciences Research, Special*, (4), 44-49.  
<https://doi.org/10.32861/jssr.spi4.44.49>
- Amankwah-Amoah, J., Boso, N., & Antwi-Agyei, I. (2018). The effects of business failure experience on successive entrepreneurial engagements: An evolutionary phase model. *Group & Organization Management*, 43(4), 648-682.  
<https://doi.org/10.1177/1059601116643447>
- Amankwah-Amoah, J., Khan, Z., & Wood, G. (2021). COVID-19 and business failures: The paradoxes of experience, scale, and scope for theory and practice. *European Management Journal*, 39(2), 179-184.  
<https://doi.org/10.1016/j.emj.2020.09.002>
- Bonaccorsi, A., Barin, L., Belingheri, P., Biagi, F., & Sanchez-Barrioluengo, M. (2023). Is higher education more important for firms than research? Disentangling university spillovers. *The Journal of Technology Transfer*, 1-26.  
<https://doi.org/10.1007/s10961-023-10008-y>
- Bray, M. (2022). Shadow education in Asia and the Pacific: features and implications of private supplementary tutoring. *International handbook on education development in Asia-Pacific*, 1-23.  
[https://doi.org/10.1007/978-981-16-2327-1\\_10-1](https://doi.org/10.1007/978-981-16-2327-1_10-1)
- Bunyaminu, A., Mohammed, I., & Issah, M. (2019). Business Failure Prediction: A Tri-dimensional Approach. *The Journal of Applied Business and Economics*, 21(2), 80-100.  
<https://doi.org/10.33423/jabe.v21i1.1456>
- Bushe, B. (2019). The causes and impact of business failure among small to micro and medium enterprises in South Africa. *Africa's public service delivery and performance review*, 7(1), 1-26.  
<https://doi.org/10.4102/apsdpr.v7i1.210>
- Cefis, E., Bettinelli, C., Coad, A., & Marsili, O. (2022). Understanding firm exit: a systematic literature review. *Small Business Economics*, 59(2), 423-446.  
<https://doi.org/10.1007/s11187-021-00480-x>
- Chirico, F., Gómez-Mejía, L. R., Hellerstedt, K., Withers, M., & Nordqvist, M. (2020). To merge, sell, or liquidate? Socioemotional wealth, family control, and the choice of business exit. *Journal of Management*, 46(8), 1342-1379.  
<https://doi.org/10.1177/0149206318818723>
- Davies, C., & van Vuuren, J. J. (2021). Entrepreneurship orientation and business discontinuance: A relationship analysis of total early-stage activities in the BRICS countries. *Journal of Contemporary Management*, 18(1), 455-481.  
<https://doi.org/10.35683/jcm20078.113>
- Ephrem, A. N., Nguet, P. M. D., Charmant, I. K., Murimbika, M., Awotide, B. A., Tahirou, A., ... & Manyong, V. (2021). Entrepreneurial motivation, psychological capital, and business success of young entrepreneurs in the DRC. *Sustainability*, 13(8), 4087.  
<https://doi.org/10.3390/su13084087>
- Hajar, A., & Karakus, M. (2022). A bibliometric mapping of shadow education research: achievements, limitations, and the future. *Asia Pacific Education Review*, 23(2), 341-359.  
<https://doi.org/10.1007/s12564-022-09759-4>
- Hashmi, M., Governatori, G., Lam, H. P., & Wynn, M. T. (2018). Are we done with business process compliance: state of the art and challenges ahead. *Knowledge and Information Systems*, 57(1), 79-133.  
<https://doi.org/10.1007/s10115-017-1142-1>
- Hohen, S., & Schweizer, L. (2021). Entrepreneurs' exit strategy intentions and their final exit paths. *Schmalenbach Journal of Business Research*, 73(3-4), 443-477.  
<https://doi.org/10.1007/s41471-021-00123-7>
- Klimas, P., Czakon, W., Kraus, S., Kailer, N., & Maalaoui, A. (2021). Entrepreneurial failure: a synthesis and conceptual framework of its effects. *European Management Review*, 18(1), 167-182.  
<https://doi.org/10.1111/emre.12426>

- Lattacher, W., & Wdowiak, M. A. (2020). Entrepreneurial learning from failure. A systematic review. *International Journal of Entrepreneurial Behavior & Research*, 26(5), 1093-1131. <https://doi.org/10.1108/IJEBR-02-2019-0085>
- Martinez, M. G., Zouaghi, F., Marco, T. G., & Robinson, C. (2019). What drives business failure? Exploring the role of internal and external knowledge capabilities during the global financial crisis. *Journal of Business Research*, 98, 441-449. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jbusres.2018.07.032>
- Mayr, S., Mitter, C., Kücher, A., & Duller, C. (2021). Entrepreneur characteristics and differences in reasons for business failure: evidence from bankrupt Austrian SMEs. *Journal of Small Business & Entrepreneurship*, 33(5), 539-558. <https://doi.org/10.1080/08276331.2020.1786647>
- Safari, A., & Das, A. (2023). Entrepreneurial failure analysis using quality management approaches. *Total Quality Management & Business Excellence*, 34(1-2), 235-260. <https://doi.org/10.1080/14783363.2022.2043739>
- Sheikh, R., Ayaz, M., & Siddique, M. A. (2023). Sharī 'ah Governance and Sharī 'ah Non-Compliance Risk Management: A Maqāsid Sharī 'ah Based Appraisal. *Journal of Islamic Thought and Civilization*, 13(1). <https://doi.org/10.32350/jitc.131.19>
- Yin, R. K. (2009). Case study research: Design and methods 4th edition. In *United States: Library of congress cataloging-in-publication data*.
- Zambrano Farias, F., Valls Martínez, M. D. C., & Martín-Cervantes, P. A. (2021). Explanatory factors of business failure: literature review and global trends. *Sustainability*, 13(18), 10154. <https://doi.org/10.3390/su131810154>